







The project is funded by the European Union

### **Central Asia Invest Programme**

### **Project Update**

**July-September 2015** 

# Development of the Fruit and Vegetable Processing Sectors in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan (DFVP)

The project is implemented by British Expertise (UK)

in partnership with

**Association of Food Industry Enterprises (Kyrgyzstan)** 

and

**National Association of Small and Medium Businesses (Tajikistan)** 

October 2015

### **Table of contents**

2. 3. 4. 5.	Activities carried out during the reporting period Deviations from the planning schedule Challenges experienced during the reporting period Planning for the next reporting period	4 9 10 11
Annexes:		
Annex 1 Annex 2	Agenda of the 5th capacity building session (Tajikistan) Food Safety expert's report on the 5th capacity building session with participants' feedback analysis	12 14 15
Annex 3	Marketing expert's report on the 4th marketing capacity building session with participants' feedback analysis	19
Annex 4 Annex 5	Report on advanced training in ISO 22000 international certification Report on the study tour to Poland	22 25

#### 1. Introduction

The project "Development of the Fruit and Vegetable Processing Sectors in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan (DFVP)" is being implemented in the framework of Central Asia Invest Programme III funded by the European Union.

There are three implementing partners of the project: British Expertise (BE), UK (non-profit organisation, the Applicant), The Association of Food Industry Enterprises (the former title as presented in the Full Application Form was "Association of Fruit and Vegetable Enterprises" (AFVE), the Association changed its name in early 2014 to better reflect new membership), Kyrgyzstan (non-profit organisation, Partner) and the National Association of Small and Medium Businesses of Tajikistan, (non-profit organisation, Partner).

The contract for the project was signed on 1 January 2014 which is considered as the start of the Inception Phase.

The project is a follow-up on the previous project implemented in the framework of Central Asia Invest II by British Expertise in partnership with BIG (NGO "Business Intellect Group", Kyrgyzstan) in Kyrgyzstan in 2011-2012. The approach to build on results achieved in Kyrgyzstan and to transfer the experience from Kyrgyzstan to Tajikistan and in particular, southern Tajikistan remains valid and will be reported during the course of the project implementation.

Important features of the approach developed at the stage of project design are "good coordination among all project partners involved", "logical sequence of the activities" and "careful reviewing of the activities and flexible adjustments answering the most outstanding needs of the beneficiaries" remain valid and are being applied.

This Project Update, like the previous ones, is written on a quarterly basis and covers months 19-21 of project implementation (July-September 2015). The first days of July (1-3 July 2015) were covered by the previous Project Update (final dates of experts' missions to Kyrgyzstan - the completion days of the final capacity building session in Kyrgyzstan and the third project Steering Committee meeting, which took place on 2 July 2015 in Bishkek).

During this reporting period, the major focus of the project has been on:

- the final capacity building sessions in HACCP/ISO 22000 and marketing in Tajikistan (month 19 of the project implementation),
- advanced training in HACCP/ISO 22000 for selected project trainees delivered by international certification company TUV (with headquarters in Germany) aimed at getting international certificates as "trainer in ISO 22 000" (month 20 of the project implementation);
- study tour to Poland for selected delegates from Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan aimed at gaining experience in advanced practices of food-processing SMEs in Poland in HACCP and marketing, as well as in Polish BIOs' approaches of work with the clients/SMEs.

The present internal Project Update Report describes activities carried out during this reporting period (months 19-21), major challenges occurred during the reporting period, deviations from the planned schedule (if any) and planning for the next (final) reporting period (months 22-24). Five annexes to the report present major information and details of the work undertaken during the reporting period.

The Project considers the Work Plan finalized during the Inception Phase and slightly adjusted at the stage of the project Interim Report (December 2014), as the basis for project implementation and the present report reflects project progress in line with this adjusted Work Plan.

#### 2. Activities carried out during the reporting period

The following activities have been implemented or are on-going during the reporting period (only those activities planned and/or completed during this reporting period are described below, see updated):

#### Activity group 1: Project launch, team mobilisation and work plan finalization

All activities planned for this activity group have been completed.

#### Activity group 2: Target group selection and needs assessment

All activities planned for this activity group have been completed.

### Activity group 3: Analysis of internal and regional/international market opportunities in the SME F&V processing sector

An analysis of internal and external markets (activity 3.2) has been completed in Kyrgyzstan.

Activity 3.1 ("Carrying out analysis of internal market in F&V sector of Tajikistan"): the first stage of the market research in Tajikistan (database on F&V processing SMEs of Hatlon region) has been completed in early 2015. The second stage of market research has been focused on the marketing initiative group established with the project support in Hatlon region and has been based on a detailed study of marketing initiative group's needs. It was completed in month 19 and the results of the research were presented and discussed with all project and placed on the NASMB website as the results of the research are fully applicable for other relevant SMEs from the South of Tajikistan. The research also contains recommendations to SMEs of the marketing group aimed at improvement of their performance and better access to the market in Dushanbe and other markets in the longer run.

### Activity group 4: Capacity building for BIOs in management, business and other client-oriented tools and techniques (ToT)

Activity 4.1 ("Detailed studying of BIOs needs (including study tour to Poland)" has been completed: all needs assessments, visa arrangements, logistics and programme development for the study tour to Poland were carried out in months 19-20.

Capacity building in management, business client-oriented tools and techniques was completed during the reporting period (activity 4.2) in Tajikistan in month 19. This formed an integral part of the fourth/final capacity building sessions in marketing implemented in Tajikistan during the reporting period (see annex 3 – Marketing expert's report for details).

#### **Activity group 5: Capacity building in food safety**

Activities 5.1 - 5.3 (5.1 - "Detailed planning of the module-based training/capacity building programme for Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan"; 5.2 - "Development of modules for each aspect on food safety, based on needs assessment"; 5.3 - "Delivery of advanced capacity building in food safety in Kyrgyzstan as a follow up from the previous CAI project"; 5.4 - "Delivery of training/capacity building in food safety aspects to Tajik target groups (BIOs and SMEs" and 5.5 - "Feedback analysis of participants") were completed in both participating countries during the reporting period.

The focus of this reporting period has been on preparation, organisation and delivery of the fifth (final) capacity building session in HACCP in Tajikistan. Annex 2 presents the detailed report of the project Food Safety Expert on the fifth capacity building session in Tajikistan. Participant feedback analysis is incorporated in the report. As indicated in the feedback from training participants from the previous training session, the final training session in food safety included video materials/case studies, as well as practical exercises on internal audits

based on the field trip to Hatlon region organized for all participants of the project's capacity building programme: three SMEs in Hatlon region of Tajikistan were visited and studied for practical training purpose (see Annex 2 for more details).

The Training Manual on Food Safety Management System (FSMS) was completed during the reporting period and its printed version distributed to all project's trainees in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. Final adjustments of the e-version of the Manual are underway.

Activity 5.6 – "Development of a course in Food Safety Management System (FSMS) for BIOs/academic institutions" is actively on-going.

Activity 5.7 – "International certification of trainers in food safety/HACCP (ToT)" has been successfully completed and extremely positive feedback received from 11 trainees participating in this advanced training course selected as a result of internal exam's analysis organized in July 2015 after the final capacity building session on HACCP/ISO 22000 in both countries. All 11 participating trainees have received international certificates as "Trainers in ISO 22000". The report on this training is presented in Annex 4.

#### **Activity group 6: Capacity building in marketing**

Activities 6.1 – 6.7 (6.1 – "Detailed planning of the capacity building programme for Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan through questionnaires and needs assessment"; 6.2 – "Studying of successful marketing strategies in F&V processing business and using them for capacity building as "best practices"; 6.3 – "Development of modules for each aspect of marketing based on needs assessment and market analysis"; 6.4 – "Delivery of advanced training/capacity building in marketing to Kyrgyz target groups (BIOs and SMEs) as a follow up from the previous CAI project"; 6.5 – "Delivery of capacity building in marketing in Tajikistan"; 6.6 – "Seminar(s) on market opportunities" and 6.7 – "Feedback analysis of participants" have been completed in both countries during the reporting period.

The focus of project activities during the reporting period has been on preparation and organisation of the fourth/final capacity building session in marketing and delivery of the final session in Tajikistan, which was organized at the beginning of this reporting period.

Annex 3 presents the report of the project marketing expert on the fourth capacity building session in Tajikistan, as well as other marketing activities undertaken within the reporting period. Participant feedback analysis is incorporated in the report.

The fourth (final) marketing training session held in Tajikistan included a significant number of practical exercises, product cost calculations and labelling development in line with the requirements of the Customs Union and local legislation. During the training session, participating SMEs provided examples of other various elements of their marketing activities, new labels, price calculation examples etc. contributing to the learning process.

#### **Activity group 7: Advisory services to F&V processing SMEs**

Activities 7.1 (a – "Planning seminars, meeting and contacts with input suppliers for pilot SMEs" in Kyrgyzstan" and b – "Support to establishing and improving contacts with input suppliers for value chain development (Tajikistan)" were on-going during the reporting period through the Project Partners in both countries.

Activities 7.2 ("Preparation and delivery of seminars/trainings in new types of F&V processing equipment (for BIOs/SMEs) -focus on Kyrgyzstan") and 7.3 – ("Selection of pilot SMEs for advisory services in implementation of food safety measures/marketing") were completed in Year 1 of the project implementation.

Activity 7.4 – "Field visits to selected SMEs": a field trip was organized in Tajikistan to Hatlon region for all project trainees: three SMEs were visited in a view of studying the potential for HACCP introduction and marketing-related aspects (see annexes 2 and 3 for more details).

Work was continued with the pilot SME "Kaindi-Kant" in Kyrgyzstan on HACCP (activity 7.5 "Advisory services to selected pilot SMEs in implementation of HACCP/food safety measures

and/or marketing strategies") during the reporting period in close cooperation with the project Food Safety expert.

As mentioned in the previous Project Update the owners of the pilot SME "Dessert" have temporarily rented out the enterprise for one year (starting from July 2015) because of financial difficulties encountered. This has been beyond project control but the major work on HACCP documentation has been completed with the project assistance.

To date, the following progress has been achieved by two pilot SMEs in Kyrgyzstan in developing HACCP documentation/measures as a necessary precondition for HACCP introduction:

#### "Kaindi-Kant" sugar plant:

- 1. Approximately 80% of all documents required by ISO 22000 and ISO 22002-1 standards have been developed with the direct project support;
- 2. Around 60% of forms of records required by ISO 22000/HACCP introduction have been developed.

#### "Dessert" F&V processing SME:

- 1. Approximately 95% of all documents required by ISO 22000 and ISO 22002-1 standards have been developed with direct project support;
- 2. Around 90% of forms of records required by ISO 22000/HACCP introduction have been developed.

Finalizing of all required documents and records can be done only at the stage of implementation of HACCP based on ISO 22000 and ISO 22002-1 standards.

This work is on-going at "Kaindi-Kant". According to information from "Dessert" management/owners, this work will be continued in 2016 once the renting period of the enterprise will be over.

In the marketing field, advisory services have been continued during the reporting period: detailed recommendations have been provided in labelling to participating SMEs in line with the new requirements of the local market and the Customs Union and to the Trade House "Taste of Sun" established under the umbrella of the Project Partner in Kyrgyzstan, which has re-started its activities in 2015.

The field visit to Hatlon region of Tajikistan also included a visit to "Chashma" NGO which provides, among other activities, trainings to women-led initiative groups involved in F&V processing and capacity building to SMEs including F&V processing sector. It is important to mention that one of the project's participating trainees working for "Chashma" NGO actively uses all training materials in marketing and HACCP distributed to all project trainees in eformat for his advisory work/consultations to F&V processing SMEs in Hatlon region.

#### **Activity group 8: Exchange of best practices and experiences**

All activities in this group were completed during the reporting period.

Activities 8.3 – "Exchange visits to selected SMEs aimed at experience sharing and mutual learning" and 8.4 – "Support to participation in F&V processing-related exhibitions by target groups' representatives" have formed an integrated part of the study tour to Poland for eight selected delegates from Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan.

During months 19-20 all preparations for the study tour to Poland were completed and the study tour (activity 8.5) successfully took place in month 21 of the project implementation (see the report on the study tour to Poland in annex 5).

### Activity group 9: Support to relevant legislation/regulations development in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan

Activity 9.2 ("Consultations with relevant stakeholders on needs and practical expert support from the project") has been completed in both countries.

Activity 9.3 ("Development of methodological recommendations on introducing HACCP system at enterprises of food industry of Kyrgyzstan") has been completed, submitted to the governmental agencies and other relevant stakeholders for circulation and comments in month 18. During the reporting period the comments have been received from the Ministry of Economy and other relevant agencies involved and currently are being analysed and feedback is being prepared. It is important to stress that this work represents a joint effort of the project's Food Safety expert and the local expert from the Project Partner in Kyrgyzstan and the development of the above document (unique for Kyrgyzstan) has been based on the ISO 22000 Manual developed by the project.

In Tajikistan, activity 9.4 ("Analysis of correspondence of the key legal acts of Tajikistan to the technical regulation of the Customs Union "On food safety") has been completed. The document "Development of the draft technical and economic justification of reforming the system of food safety" has been developed and submitted to the Ministry of Economy during the previous reporting period. It is planned to discuss it with the governmental agencies by the Project Partner in Tajikistan (NASMB) in months 22-23 of the project, preliminary appointments have been made on this subject.

Activity 9.5 "Seminar on presentation of legal advice support provided aimed at protecting national producers") has been completed.

#### Activity group 10: Promotion, dissemination and visibility actions

These activities are on-going, with regular information-sharing with all relevant stakeholders (activities 10.1 and 10.2). It is being regularly updated on the websites of both project partners thus creating a web platform of real value for information sharing. All training materials, project and experts' reports, press releases, photos etc. are regularly updated.

To date, all project training materials, experts' reports have been placed on the websites of both Project Partners (activity 10.3 – "Development of the project web platform for information sharing and capacity in food safety/marketing"). 11 internationally certified trainers in ISO 22000 are providing their updated CVs to the websites of both Project Partners in order to be used by SMEs as resource persons/consultants for SMEs introducing/willing to introduce HACCP/ISO 22000.

Visibility items produced earlier continue to be disseminated to the relevant stakeholders. The ISO 22000 Manual publication (100 copies) has been added to the items during the reporting period and was disseminated to all relevant stakeholders in addition to all participants of the project's capacity building programme in both countries.

Business cards and promotion materials have been developed for the study tour to Poland (for Tajik delegates – promo-leaflets/flyers with presentation of their products and contact details). EU logos and project description was incorporated into the leaflets/flyers. They were broadly distributed at the Pol Agra international exhibition in Poland.

Project information is continued to be regularly reflected in the bi-monthly Information Bulletins being issued by the Project Partner in Kyrgyzstan.

Press-releases have been produced covering project events in Tajikistan in line with EU requirements (in Russian, English and Tajik for Tajikistan).

All project trainees received certificates on completion of the project's capacity building programme (during this reporting period – in Tajikistan) with all EU and project partners' logos and CAI Programme visibility.

#### **Activity group 11: Finalization phase**

Activities in this group started ahead of schedule - in month 19 of the project implementation with the discussion of the project's exit strategy with both Project Partners (activity 11.1). It has been jointly decided that the key elements of the strategy should include: (1) distribution of all project training and information materials in printed and eformat to all project trainees and relevant stakeholders just after completion of the project's capacity building programme (months 18-19, ahead of schedule) thus allowing participating SMEs and BIOs to use them for improvements of HACCP and marketing elements well before the project end; (2) considering a few additional outputs which will increase the prospects for sustainability of the project's results (like development of the website for the marketing initiative group in Tajikistan allowing them to develop further and to update the information on their products thus increasing market opportunities; translation of the project Marketing Manual into Tajik for broader coverage of this project "product" by relevant target groups etc.); (3) preparation of the academic course on FSMS (as additional output of the project) in order to ensure sustainable knowledge transfer in HACCP/ISO 22000 for younger generation; (4) making additional contacts and linkages with relevant companies able to provide further services and capacity building in ISO 22000, marketing and export potential development for both Project Partners and participating SMEs: contacts with internationally-certified firm "Advisor" based in Ukraine has been established with both Project Partners. The company has wide experience in Central Asia and, particularly, in Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, and is ready to discuss further plans to follow up steps which will strengthen and develop the project's achievements and (5) preparation of the project's sustainability and follow up plan with realistic steps to be undertaken by the Project Partners and relevant stakeholders in order to sustain the results achieved by the project.

Activity 11.4 – "Development of a project sustainability action plan" started in month 19 and is on-going.

#### **Activity group 12: Project management**

All activities of this activity group are on-going.

The project database has been completed in both countries (activity 12.3) ahead of schedule and was included in the memory sticks with all project information to allow all participating stakeholders accessing contact information on all relevant stakeholders, including not only the project target groups but relevant governmental and private sector agencies, academic institutions and international donor-funded projects.

Regular contacts and Skype conferences are being maintained among all project partners and experts involved. Feedback from all participating stakeholders is being collected and analysed.

Internal reporting and internal monitoring are on-going (activity 12.6): the quarterly project updates are being regularly produced in addition to the reporting laid down in EU requirements.

#### 3. Deviations from the planning schedule

No major deviations occurred during the reporting period. One activity described below has been slightly re-scheduled in order to make it fully consistent with the priorities of the Government of Tajikistan. All other activities not mentioned in this section of the report are being implemented as planned.

#### Activity group 8: Exchange of best practices and experiences

Activity 8.4 "Support to participation in F&V processing-related exhibitions by target group representatives" have been combined with activity 8.5 "Study tour to Poland for selected SMEs and BIOs" in due course, to use the opportunity to attend very relevant exhibition "PolAgra 2015" in Poznan, Poland, by the most relevant participants selected by the project (month 21). Preparations for this study tour have started and completed ahead of schedule, in month 19 (planned to start from month 20).

### Activity group 9: Support to relevant legislation/regulation development in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan

Activity 9.3: as stated in section 2 of this report, work has been continued in the present reporting period and will be continued till the end of the project if needed. The document developed and circulated (see section 2 , activity group 9 for more details) is currently passing the second round of comments from the project's Food Safety expert and the project's and the role of the project is now seen as making its content as understandable and helpful for SMEs as possible for HACCP system development and implementation. Moreover, it has to be fully based on the current legislation in Kyrgyzstan.

The legal input for Tajikistan (activity 9.4) has been drafted as planned but the feedback from the relevant agencies involved is pending again so it is hoped that by the end of the project it will be discussed and agreed with relevant governmental agencies.

#### **Activity group 11 – Finalization phase**

The activities of this group have been started ahead of schedule with production and dissemination of marketing manuals and memory sticks with all project information and training materials (in Tajikistan during this reporting period) in order to facilitate their use by BIOs and SMEs participating in the project, as well as by other relevant stakeholders.

Development of additional project outputs have started (website for the marketing initiative group in Tajikistan and academic course on FSMS).

All the above slight deviations are in line with the project flexibility approach and other activities are not affected by them.

#### 4. Challenges experienced during the reporting period

No major challenges were experienced during the reporting period. A few minor ones are worth mentioning, namely:

- The pending feedback from the relevant ministries in Tajikistan on a formulated project legal input (see sections 2 and 3 for more details) might put at risk the work done by the project, although this input was agreed with the Ministry of Economic development in the previous reporting period. NASMB continues to make efforts to facilitate the feedback process. Preliminary the meeting of the relevant working group established to address the issues of WTO membership action plan (and to discuss the document prepared by the project as a part of the actions to be undertaken by Tajikistan in food safety field) is planned for months 22-23 of the project implementation.
- The project pilot SME "Dessert" in Kyrgyzstan continues facing challenges with their owners' approach to the future of this enterprise. As stated in the previous Project Update, "Dessert" was rented out to another F&V processing company. The rent contract will be continued until 2016. Taking into account that this pilot SME was and still is the closest among all participating SME to start introducing HACCP into practice, at the stage of Interim report (end of Year 1 of the project implementation) the decision was taken to add one indicator to the project's logical framework: "At least one pilot SME has developed all HACCP documentation and introduced HACCP".

Although the development of almost all HACCP documentation has been done with the project support and some HACCP elements have been introduced, this sharp change in the approach to further development of "Dessert" creates uncertainties as for the commitment of the management/owners to introduce HACCP in practice, at least in the timeframe of the project. Although the above indicator aimed at introducing HACCP at least at one SME has been added to the project logical framework at the stage of Interim report, as "Dessert" was ready to start this process at that time, the circumstances described above lie beyond project control and therefore this indicator will be deleted from the project logframe at the stage of Final report. This is in line with the project's flexibility approach and does not affect original indicators developed for the project.

#### 5. Planning for the next reporting period

As described in section 2, most of the planned activities have been completed. The major focus of remaining activities during the next (final) reporting period (months 22-24, October-December 2015) will be on:

- ⇒ **Activity group 5:** Active work on development of the Training course on FSMS for academic institutions will be continued and completed. It will be presented in both countries in months 23-24 in technical universities involving broad audience of relevant teachers and students. The work on finalizing the e-version of ISO 22000 Manual will be completed.
- ⇒ **Activity group 7:** Advisory services to F&V processing SMEs: this activity will be continued through permanent work with pilot SMEs in Kyrgyzstan and will be ongoing in Tajikistan with two selected pilot SMEs and marketing initiative group established with the project support in the South of Tajikistan (Hatlon region). It is planned to prepare and send all basic programmes required to fill in by pilot SMEs in Tajikistan for HACCP introduction.
  - A Field visit to "Kaindi-Kant" SME in Kyrgyzstan is planned for month 23 aimed at verifying the actual work done towards HACCP introduction and providing further advice for improvements.
- ⇒ **Activity group 8:** Exchange of best practices and experiences: the project will join the Annual Conference to be organized by AFVE, the Project Partner, on 24-26 November 2015. The project achievements will be shared with all relevant stakeholders at the conference.
- ⇒ **Activity group 9:** Support to relevant legislation/regulations development in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan: activity 9.3 will be continued in Kyrgyzstan until final approval of the document developed by the project by the Government of Kyrgyzstan although the major input from the project has been done. Activity 9.4 (aimed at legal input for Tajikistan) will be finalized once/if the comments from relevant governmental agencies will be received.
- ⇒ **Activity group 10:** Promotion, dissemination and visibility actions: this activity is on-going and will be continued (activities 10.1-10.3). The website for the marketing initiative group in Tajikistan will be completed. "Annual conference with presentation of project achievements and information sharing" will be organized in the framework of the Annual AFVE conference thus allowing reaching broad audience of the relevant stakeholders in F&V sector. The Project Partner from Tajikistan (NASMB) will join the conference as well.
- ⇒ Activity group 11 Finalization phase: the activities will be continued with active preparation and discussion of the project Sustainability action/follow up plan with relevant stakeholders and the project target groups in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. The final survey among the project trainees will be organized and feedback incorporated into the project final report.
- ⇒ **Activity group 12:** Project management: this activity will be continued on a permanent basis until the end of the project. The final Steering Committee meeting will take place in month 23.

#### Annex 1: Agenda of the 5th capacity building session (Tajikistan)

#### **Central Asia Invest Programme III**

#### Development of the Fruit and Vegetable Processing Sectors in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan (DFVP) project

#### 5th capacity building session

#### 6 -8 July 2015

Dushanbe, Tajikistan

Time	Topic	Speaker/Trainer		
6 July, Monday				
8:00	8:00 Field trip to Kurgan-Tube			
7 July, Tuesday				
9:00 - 11:00	HACCP/food safety training: Practical exercises	Gennadii Kuznetsov/ Food Safety/HACCP expert, British Expertise		
11:00 - 11:15	Coffee break	Gennadii Kuznetsov/ Food Safety/HACCP expert, British Expertise		
11:15 - 13:00	13:00 HACCP/food safety training: Practical exercises  HACCP/food safety training: Safety/HACCP exercises British Expertises			
13:00 - 14:00	Обед			
14: 00 - 16:00	HACCP/food safety training: Theoretical training	Gennadii Kuznetsov/ Food Safety/HACCP expert, British Expertise		
16:00 - 16:15	Coffee break			
System) Safety/HACCP e		Gennadii Kuznetsov/ Food Safety/HACCP expert, British Expertise		
18:00 - 18:15	Filling in feedback questionnaires by participa	ants (food safety/HACCP)		
8 July, Wednesda	ay			
9:00 – 11:00  Seminar on marketing: Methods of products' market promotion		Natalya Kozak/Marketing expert, British Expertise		
11:00 - 11:15	Coffee break			
Training in marketing:  Practical questions of labels' development for juices and juice-based drinks		Natalya Kozak/Marketing expert, British Expertise		

13:00 - 13:45	Lunch		
13:45 - 15:30	<u>Training in marketing:</u> Calculation of net cost of final product	Natalya Kozak/Marketing expert, British Expertise	
15:30 - 15:45	Coffee break		
15:45 - 16:45	Presentation of preliminary results of market research	Zafar Alizoda/the Head of marketing group, Khatlon region	
16:45 - Providing certificates on participation in the project's capacity building programme and manuals			

### Annex 2: Food Safety Expert's report on the 5th capacity building session with participants' feedback analysis

#### **REPORT ON MISSION No 5**

06.07 - 10.07.2015

#### **TAJIKISTAN**

#### Gennadiy Kuznetsov Project Food Safety Expert

#### 1. Key results and conclusions.

Training on HACCP in Tajikistan was successfully carried out. Positive replies of all participants confirm this statement.

On the basis of the total of five trainings the following conclusions can be made:

- A combination of practical and theoretical components with emphasis on practical trainings is the most effective way to ensure an acceptable level of knowledge of training participants that will allow them to develop, implement and use the HACCP system or Food Safety Management System (FSMS) in accordance with ISO 22000 and ISO 22002-1 standards;
- The most effective method of practical trainings is visiting food processing enterprises followed by a detailed discussion of both positive and negative aspects of FSMS elements available on these enterprises in the classroom.

### 2. Visits of the F&V processing small and medium enterprises (SMEs) (Hatlon Oblast, 6 July, 2015)

After a fourteen hour journey, the trainees, the Project Partner and the Project team visited the following F&V processing SMEs which are located in Hatlon region:

- «44 Chashma»;
- «Navbakhor 2013», Ltd;
- «Kurgan-Tubinskiy food factory», JSC.

The purpose of the visits was to conduct "mini" inspection of these enterprises with a view to the following:

- to give the trainees practical experience in assessment of implementation of prerequisite programs;
- to provide the trainees with inspection skills;
- to provide to F&V processing SMEs with advice regarding improvement of food hygiene conditions.

All trainees were provided with inspection forms and were requested to fill these in during the implementation of "mini" inspections.

#### 3. Summary of the HACCP training (Dushanbe, 7 July, 2015)

The training was attended by representatives from:

- F&V processing SMEs;
- Business Intermediate Organizations (BIOs) providing consultancy services to these SMEs;
- international technical assistance projects;
- government regulatory bodies;
- high academic institutions.

The one day training consisted of the following parts:

- discussion in the classroom of previous day visits to SMEs;
- presentation of Zulfiya YADGAROVA, the participant of the capacity building programme - "Audit of Quality Management System. Explanation of ISO 19011 Standard Requirements";
- discussion of certain provisions for implementation of ISO 22000 standard; in particular, the main differences and similarities of three programs of food hazards control in the standard: Pre-requisite Programs, Operational Pre-requisite Programs and HACCP plan;
- an examination. The main purpose of the exam was to select trainees for an additional week of advanced training to be delivered by international TÜV trainer (TUV, a German-based international certification company) to be held in late July 2015 in Bishkek. As a result of this advanced training and additional exam to be held on its basis, successful participants will receive TÜV Rheinland certificates of ISO 22000 trainers. Annex 1 shows the top 3 results of the examination papers of trainees in Dushanbe (three participants from Tajikistan have been selected for participation in the advanced;
- meeting of trainees with management of a newly started project "Enhanced competitiveness of Tajik agribusiness" financed by the EU.

Training videos were used in accordance with the requests of the participants expressed during the previous training sessions. These videos showed positive examples of food hygiene requirements' implementation as well as some negative ones. These negative examples were the subject of detailed discussion during the training session.

#### 4. Generalization of participants' replies on questioner regarding training.

Appendix 2 shows the summary of the participants' responses to the questionnaire which was filled in after the workshop. The questionnaire contained a request to answer on the following questions using the five-point scale:

- whether the workshop was useful;
- content of the workshop;
- atmosphere of the workshop;
- style of workshop conducting;
- training materials;
- to comment these issues.

All participants positively commented on the usefulness of the workshop, the style of its conduction, the atmosphere and handouts' quality.

#### 5. Work undertaken between 4th and 5th missions (April-beginning of July 2015).

"RECOMMENDATIONS ON REFORM OF STATE FOOD CONTROL SYSTEM IN TAJIKISTAN" have been developed in order to implement provisions of the paragraph "Reform of Food Safety", section IV. "Sanitary and phytosanitary measures (SPS)" of "Program of adaptation of economy of the Republic of Tajikistan in relation to its membership in the World Trade Organization (WTO)", which was approved by the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan (Decision  $N^{o}$  691 from 31 October 2014). These recommendations consist of the following sections:

- I. Analysis of the existing system of food state control.
- II. Justification of the choice of optimum reforms option of food state control system's institutional component.
- III. Optimum model of food state control system.
- IV. Methods of reform of food state control system through creation of a single control authority.
- V. Financial and economic aspects of the reform.
- VI. Creation of the state food control system with single control body.

- VII. Institutional component of the reform of the state control system.
- VIII. Stages of the reforming process.
- IX. Expected results.

#### 6. Plans for the final stage of training.

In the framework of the project the following activities It is planned for the final stage of training:

- completion of the training course on FSMS based on HACCP principles; This course will be prepared specifically for high academic institutions; presentation will be organized for teachers and students in Dushanbe to explain its main focus and purpose;
- assistance to pilot SMEs provision of advice on preparation of prerequisite programmes in accordance with ISO 22002-1 standard, as well as documents envisaged by ISO 22000 standard;
- continuation of legislative work in food safety sphere.

#### **RESULTS OF THE EXAMINATION PAPERS**

#### 07.07.2015 (Dushanbe)

#### (Maximum Possible Total Points - 30)

No	Name and Family Name	Institution/ country	S1 (*) points	S2(*) points	S3(*) points	Total points	Remarks
1.	Zulfiya YADGAROVA	Independent consultant, The Tajik Republic	9	6	10	25	Participant of the TUV training
2.	Maksudakhon ABDULLAEVA	Technological University of Tajikistan, The Tajik Republic	9	7	8	24	Participant of the TUV training
3.	Sitora SHEROVA	The Center of Standardization and Metrology, The Tajik Republic	9	6	9	24	Participant of the TUV training

 $<sup>(\</sup>mbox{*})$  Abbreviation S1, S2 and S3 means, respectively, Section 1, Section 2 and Section 3 of the examination paper.

### Summary of 11 replies of HACCP workshop participants, Dushanbe 07 July, 2015

#### 1. The training was:

```
Very useful – 11 people;
Rather useful – 1 person;
Interesting, but not useful – 0;
Useless – 0.
```

Comments (participants' style and punctuation are saved):

"To conduct the audit, the educational materials will be useful and necessary for the participants of the training", "learnt to write audit reports in practice, which is very topical for us now", "Useful information from representative of GOST STANDART (Gosstandart), audit and reporting of organizations", "Since this training is very important for me, I really liked it because I use this knowledge and materials in the work and at enterprises of RT (Republic of Tajikistan) to improve the QMS (Quality Management System)", "A lot of examples were given on hygiene preparation, vegetable and products processing".

#### 2. Estimate the following on five-point points scale, please:

```
A) training content:

«5» - 12 people;

«4» - 0;

«3» - 0;

«2» - 0.
```

Comments (participants' style and punctuation are saved):

"After the visit of manufacturing enterprises, the concept of audit became clear, responsibilities of the auditor, etc.", "I think that the material is complete. This training is to improve and correspondence to the requirements of HACCP and 22002: 2009".

```
B) training atmosphere:

«5» - 9 people;

«4» - 3 people;

«3» - 0;

«4» - 0.
```

Comments (participants' style and punctuation are saved):

"The representatives of the enterprises were not very serious about the implementation of tasks."

```
C) style of conducting:

«5» - 8 people;

«4» - 3 people;

«3» - 0;

«2» - 0.
```

Comments (participants' style and punctuation are saved):

"Super", "Understandable".

```
«2» - 0.
```

Comments (participants' style and punctuation are saved): "Understandable".

#### 3. Estimate the training topics on 5 points scale, please:

```
Theoretical training:

«5» - 10 people;

«4» - 1 people;

«3» - 0;

«2» - 0.

Practical training:

«5» - 8 people;

«4» - 3 people;

«3» - 0;

«2» - 0.
```

Comments (participants' style and punctuation are saved):

"Thank you very much for your knowledge which you share with us", "Theoretical materials are backed with practical ones and by showing films on the subject of the seminar", "Professionally", "This project is very useful and topical. Thanks a lot to the organizers, especially to the coach Gennadiy Kuznetsov for the material presented".

### Annex 3: Marketing expert's report on the 4th marketing capacity building session with participants' feedback analysis (Kyrgyzstan)

#### **REPORT ON MISSION No 4**

#### 6-8 July 2015 Tajikistan

#### Natalya Kozak Project Marketing Expert

The 5th (final) training session in Tajikistan included visits to a number of enterprises (SMEs) and organizations of the Hatlon region organized for all project's trainees and training course on marketing.

Site visits were organized to:

- non-profit public organization "Chashma" (Shachrituzsky district, the chair person -Sanovbar Imomnazarova);
- · SME producing drinking water "Chashma 44",
- Kurgan-Tube food factory (the project's pilot SME);
- "Behbudi" cooperative/SME (the project's marketing group member).

The public organization "Chashma" focuses its activities on poverty reduction and community development in the region, paying special attention to women and the poorest people of the region. Currently, "Chashma" is working with informal groups, producing home-made canned food, dried fruits, dried spices. It closely works with private entrepreneurs producing canned vegetables. Another direction of Chashma's activities is focused on textile/manufacturing of school uniforms. An informal group of women engaged in manufacturing of home canned foods, was recommended to start production of unique cans, which are not produced by processing enterprises due to their high complexity. At the same time, such cans may become the hallmark of this group and bring it to the market of Tajikistan, as the comparative advantage of any company that produces unique products based on the national recipes and environmentally-friendly raw materials. This niche in the local market is still vacant; it can provide the group members with steady income. During the field visit to the cannery (SME located nearby), which also cooperates with the "Chashma", comments on sanitation and hygiene of production were provided; additional comments were made on the quality and content of the products' labels that do not meet the requirements of modern national legislation of Tajikistan.

During the field visit to Kurgan-Tube food factory, the training participants filled in evaluation forms on HACCP, which were later analysed in the course of the training; the participants tasted canned food and made comments on the visual and taste characteristics of the enterprise products and this was further discussed during the marketing training session.

The training course was attended by the representatives of food processing enterprises and companies/business intermediates (BIOs) providing consultation services to small and medium enterprises (SMEs).

The training course participants have been introduced into the following presentations:

- "Methods of product marketing promotion",
- "One more time about can labelling",
- "Calculation of cost of finished products".

Materials of the first presentation contained information about the ways and methods of products' marketing promotion, types and principles of design of efficient advertising content, types and principles of marketing campaigns.

The second presentation was devoted to the labelling of canned products, including juice products and other types of canned fruits and vegetables, in accordance with the requirements of technical regulations of Tajikistan. This topic has been already discussed at

one of the previous trainings, but according to the feedback of the training participants expressed in the questionnaires, the topic was discussed in more detail during the final capacity building session. The processing season for raw fruit and vegetables has started and processing enterprises have to proceed with design and manufacturing of labels in accordance with the new requirements in Tajikistan. During the workshops the participants made "work on mistakes," i.e. they were offered real (life) examples of labels, where the companies made mistakes at the labels' design stage.

During the presentations the quality management systems at enterprises were discussed along with basic requirements of the Republic of Tajikistan and the Customs Union (Eurasian Union between Russia, Belarus, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Armenia) to labelling of food products, formulated in technical requirements of the Republic of Tajikistan dated October 14<sup>th</sup>, 2014, No. 642; dated January 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2014 No.29; regulations of the Customs Union *TP TC* 023/2011, *TP TC* 021/2011 and *TP TC* 005/2011.

Special attention was given to information on types of packaging, advantages and drawbacks of particular types of packaging, as well as perspective/advanced types of packaging which may be used in food canning industry.

Materials of the third presentation contained information on how to develop cost calculation of finished products. The topic has been chosen for consideration in the training session in accordance with the wishes of the training participants expressed in their feedback questionnaires filled in during the previous training session on marketing, because many companies are not engaged in calculations of planned and actual costs of the finished products and results in production of a loss-making product.

After completion of the training session the participants filled in questionnaires and evaluated information received during the whole training course on marketing. Questionnaires' results have been processed and analysed.

The table below presents brief analysis of the training presentations on marketing by the training participants by training topics:

Topic	Number of training participants who have evaluated a topic as an interesting one	In % of total number of training participants who have filled in the questionnaire		
"Methods of products marketing promotion"				
Advertising campaigns	10	91		
Personal (individual) sale	6	55		
Public relations	3	27		
Promotion campaigns	2	18		
"One more time about cans labelling"				
Lessons learned (work on mistakes)	9	82		
Labelling of fruit and vegetable juice products	5	45		
Labelling of canned food products	5	45		
Calculation of cost of finished products				
Information was useful	10	91		
Information was interesting	5	45		
Information was not useful				

Thus, it is possible to conclude that all topics were interesting and useful for the training participants, which is proved by the questioning results. The most important topics included issues related to development of advertising campaign, calculation of cost of finished products and product labelling.

Also during this session, the second meeting of companies-members of the marketing group of Hatlon region was held. Several versions of the logo for the Hatlon marketing groups were designed and proposed for review and comments of the training participants, including members of the group.

In addition, during this meeting the future directions of the marketing group activities were discussed based on the analysis of the market of canned products in Tajikistan. The presentation with analysis of production and future perspectives of the marketing group members based on actual supply-demand situation in Tajikistan, brief analysis of key internal markets etc. was conducted by Zafar Alizoda, the Head of informal marketing group.

In compliance with the project plan, 100 copies of "Manual on Marketing and Business Management" were printed for the final training session and disseminated among all training participants.

In accordance with the project work plan, preparatory work on the organization of a study tour to Poland has been carried out, i.e., study tour participants were selected; the study tour program was developed together with the Polish colleagues; hotels were booked and transport company was selected, which would provide services on the territory of Poland; invitations needed to get Schengen visas were prepared and sent by the Polish colleagues to the study tour participants. From Tajikistan all four members of informal marketing group were selected as delegates to Poland (see the list of all delegates in the previous mission report on marketing).

The following materials were used in the process of the presentations' development:

- 1. TP TC 021/2011 Technical regulations of the Customs Union "On food products safety".
- 2. TP TC 005/2011 Technical regulations of the Customs Union "On packaging safety".
- 3. TP TC 023/2011 "Technical regulations on juice products made of fruit and vegetables".
- 4. Technical regulations of the Republic of Tajikistan "Food products labelling" from 03.01.2014, # 29.
- 5. "Technical regulations on juice products made of fruit and (or) vegetables" of the Republic of Tajikistan from 14.10.2014, # 642.
- 6. Methods of cost calculation http://www.cfin.ru/management/finance/cost/production/
- 7. Russian Union o juice producers "Labelling of juice products manufactured of fruit and (or) vegetables, placed on consumer packaging".

#### Annex 4: Report on advanced training in ISO 22000 international certification

Dr. Evgenia Novozhylova Lead Auditor on FSSC 22000, ISO 22000 GTAS, HACCP, ISO 9001 Senior Lecturer of TUV Academy

During the reporting period, the training course "Food Safety Management Systems" (ISO 22000) was carried out in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan from 27 to 31 July 2015. The advanced training course was implemented in the framework of the EU CAI DFVP project under the contract between British Expertise (The Applicant) and "TUV-ZUD Ltd."

The course was carried out based on the following standard programme:

## Programme of training course «Development and implementation of Food Safety Management System (ISO 22000 requirements) for food sector»

D (4:	Description (details of training sections	
Day/time	Description/details of training sessions	
Day 1		
9:00 - 9:30	Registration, dissemination of training hand-outs, meeting	
9:30 - 11:00	Introduction:	
	1. International food legislation: what's new	
	2. Definitions, key concept (15 min. of case-study)	
11:00 -11:30	Coffee break	
11:30 - 13:00	1. Introduction into HACCP system (hazards risks,	
	causes/advantages of implementation of Food Safety	
	Management System (FSMS); 7 principals and 12 steps on	
	HACCP system implementation)	
12,00 14,00	2. Summary Lunch	
13:00 - 14:00 14:00 - 17:00	Pre-requisite programmes and operation prerequisite	
14.00 - 17.00	programmes (PRPs & oPRPs):	
	1. Establishing and selecting of PRPs as on kinds of food	
	enterprises, examples, exercises	
	2. oPRPs: flow diagrams, process steps, examples, case-study	
Day 2		
9:00 - 11:00	Preliminary steps to enable hazard analysis and HACCP plan:  1. Creation of Food safety Team, product characteristics, characteristics of end products, intended use (incl. case-study)  2. Conducting of hazard analysis and evaluating of hazard significance (incl. case-study)	
11:00 - 11:15	Coffee break	
11:15 - 13:00	Practical identification of critical control points (CCPs) and its documentation	
13:00 - 14:00	Lunch	
14:00 - 17:00	Case studies	
Day 3		
9:00 - 11:00	Determination of critical limits for critical control points, system	
	for monitoring of CCPs:	
	1. Definitions, sources of information, determination of critical	
	limits	
	2. Selection and assessment of control measures (case-study)	
11:00 - 11:15	Coffee – break	
11:15 - 13:00	Determination of critical limits for critical control points, system for monitoring of CCPs: continuation  1. Validation of critical limits	

	2. Monitoring of every CCP		
13:00 - 14:00	Lunch		
14:00 - 17:00	Practical work: international methods and approaches for efficient		
	decision of problems (Method Phylips 66, Isikawa Diagram, Tree of		
	decisions; matrix of hazards evaluation)		
Day 4			
9:00 - 9:30	Examination of homework, answers for questions, review section		
9:30 - 11.00	<b>Establishing of corrective actions on possible non-conformities:</b>		
	1. Corrections, corrective and preventive actions: what difference?		
	Monitoring system and process evaluation		
	Monitoring system and production evaluation		
11:00 - 11:30	Coffee break		
11:30 - 11:45	Case-study		
11:45 - 13:00	FSMS - continuation:		
	Emergency preparedness and response		
13:00 - 14:00	Lunch		
14:00 - 17:00	Documentation of HACCP plan and FSMS. General principles:		
	Validation and verification planning for HACCP plan		
	Documentation requirements and control of documents		
	3. Procedures for HACCP plan updating		
	4. Improvement of the FSMS		
	5. Review sections		
Day 5			
9:00 - 11:00	Introduction into audit process:		
	Diagnostics and internal audits, FSMS analysis		
	2. Check-list (questionnaire)		
	3. Non-conformities, audit report, plan of corrective actions		
11:00 - 11:15	Coffee-break		
11:15 - 13:00	Introduction into audit process – continuation:		
	1. Audit process		
	2. Auditor: role, qualification, competence, awareness,		
	responsibilities		
	3. FSMS certification on ISO 22000:2005 requirements		
12.00 14.00	4. Case study		
13:00 - 14:00	Lunch		
14:00-16.30	Test exam paper		
16.30 - 17.00	Feedback		

There were 11 participants in the course, including 8 specialists from Kyrgyzstan and 3 specialists from Tajikistan (see the list in the table below).

The training course included:

- in-depth familiarization with legal requirements of the EU and the WTO for food sector;
- general principles and statements of ISO 22000;
- features of development of the HACCP system and its records,
- selection of different prerequisite programs (PRPs and oPRPS) and other aspects.

During the course, the participants received numerous skills to develop FSMS documentation and were introduced to various case studies, participated in business games and gained in-depth knowledge of the practical application of the FSMS requirements in order to develop and implement their own FSMS at the level of food enterprise.

At the end of the training sessions, the participants were able to check the knowledge obtained through practical work and the different exercises; wrote test exam and dealt successfully with all training tasks.

#### Results of test exam (maximum 30 marks)

No.	Name, Surname	Marks received
1	Daria KODZHEGULOVA	28
2	Aizhan DZHAKSHYLYKOVA	28
3	Elena KOMISSAROVA	27
4	Ainakan SADYROVA	27
5	Irina TSOI	28,5
6	Chinara DIKANBAEVA	28,5
7	Dinara AITMURZAEVA	28,5
8	Ainura DJUMANALIYEVA	29
9	Zulfiya YADGAROVA	29
10	Sitora SHEROVA	28
11	Maksudakhon ABDULLAEVA	28

All specialists highly appreciated the clarity of presentations, clearness, explanations and using the 5-grade quality and quantity system methods (namely: brain-storming session, "Fish bones" diagram, "Philips-66" technique, Risks Assessment Matrix, Decision Tree) have highly assessed the lecturer's experience and competence in their feedback sheets. Participants sent letters to the Project Partners to confirm their full appreciation of the course.

All participants received certificates of TUV Rheinland Group thus confirming their competence to train food specialists according to ISO 22000 requirements.



#### **Annex 5: Report on the study tour to Poland** (September 20 - 26, 2015)

#### Natalya Kozak/Marketing expert (British Expertise)

Eight representatives from the food processing enterprises and companies providing consulting services/Business Intermediate Organizations (BIOs) to small and medium size enterprises (SMEs) from Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan including representatives from the project pilot enterprises participated in the study tour.

Kyrgyzstan representatives included:

- 1) Abdulajan Tashmatov "Desert" Ltd (pilot SME);
- 2) Nurilia Karabekova JSC "Kaindy Kant" (pilot SME);
- 3) Ainura Djumanaliyeva "Promtest" Ltd (BIO)
- 4) Aizhan Adylbekova Association of Fruit and Vegetable Processing Enterprises (AFVE) the Project Partner (BIO).

Tajikistan representatives included:

- 1) Zafar Aliozoda Consulting Council on Entrepreneurship Development at Khaltonskaya Oblast Chairman (BIO);
- 2) Rustam Sadunoyev PJSC "Kurgan-Tube Food Factory" (pilot SME);
- 3) Dzhurakchon Sufarov "Sharob" Ltd (SME);
- 4) Machmadrazab Epmuradov "Navbakhar 2013" Ltd (SME).

#### I. Visit to International Exhibition in Poland

The study tour agenda envisaged the visit to the International Exhibition in Poland, where the study tour participants could visit exhibition pavilions of POLAGRA FOOD, POLAGRA-TECH, PAKFOOD, POLAGRAGASTRO, as well as exhibition SMAKIREGIONOW ("Tastes of regions").

Firstly, participants paid attention to stands of the enterprises-manufacturers of compact small-scale equipment for food canning industry. Equipment from other Polish and European manufacturers was also presented at the exhibition.

The study tour participants were interested in the Austrian company "Voran", manufacturer of equipment for production of juice of direct pressing of vegetables, fruits and berries. VORAN equipment is compact, simple and very convenient in its use. The company is client-oriented and focuses on a module approach to its production line. All equipment from the very beginning (acceptance and washing of raw product) and up to the finished product (bottling in bag-in-box package or glass package) is supplied as one system with production capacity 500 – 2000 L/h.

"Voran" also produces mobile lines M500 for production of juice of direct pressing, combining high production capacity and other advantages of stationary line with mobility. All equipment is placed on an automobile trailer made of aluminum and may be transported to any place convenient for juice production – an orchard, storage facility for fruit, etc. The line is completely ready for operation – communication lines connection and installation for fruit processing take few minutes. ("Voran" has its branch office in Kyrgyzstan).

A considerable part of the exhibition was dedicated to metal detectors for food processing enterprises. This is equipment which almost all SMEs participating in the project lack, but it is critically important for ensuring quality and safety of products.

Equipment from the Austrian company "Kreuzmaur" was also widely presented at the exhibition. "Kreuzmayr" GmbH specializes in provision of comprehensive technology for production of jams for SMEs; the company also manufactures mobile juice lines with capacity of 500 and 1400 L of juice per hour.

In addition, each study tour participant had an opportunity to get acquainted with equipment which was of interest for him/her; to receive detailed information and contacts of manufacturing companies. It was also very important that exhibition's equipment was

manufactured specifically for small and medium size producers, i.e. it is compact, not requiring significant production space for its assembling.

Exhibition participants were represented by the companies and chambers of commerce of many countries, including those from the former CIS (Commonwealth of Independent States) countries, for example, Ukraine, Latvia, Georgia, Belarus which presented their products, including cans produced by national recipes. The participants had a chance to learn from them. For example, the Georgian producers displayed their sauces and condiments, brandy and wine, the Ukrainian producers, chocolate, tinned products, and the Latvians, dairy products.

#### Study tour evaluation by the participants

According to participants, the study tour to Poland was a great success. It provided the opportunity for all delegates to change their views on the importance of HACCP introduction and marketing strategies to be applied almost completely (this was the key objective of the study tour).

It is worth mentioning that one of the owners of the pilot SME "Dessert" from Kyrgyzstan participated in the study tour has reconsidered his approach to renting out an enterprise to a third party (see the details in the main body of the report) and, hopefully, starting from 2016 the work done on HACCP together with the project will be finalized.

Briefly, the following key points have been acknowledged by the study tour delegates' feedback:

- Received information about new technologies, not known before;
- Received information about new technological lines not requiring much production space and affordable for purchasing;
- Established very useful contacts with equipment manufacturers;
- Saw various ways of product presentation and this has had an implication on their approach to various marketing tools, labels, advertisement campaigns etc. at their own enterprises;
- Have noted the stages and procedures of HACCP and willing to start/continue this process upon return.

**II. Site visits** (the information on site visits has been prepared on the basis of the delegates' feedback/data collection at sites, with focus on HACCP requirements and marketing opportunities at each site, as advised by the project's Food Safety and Marketing experts).

#### 1. Visit to dairy cooperative SPOMLEK, branch office in Heinitze

http://www.spomlek.pl/index ru.php), 9, Igelskaya Str.

The dairy cooperative produces hard and semi-hard cheeses. Other dairy branches produce butter, sour cream, cream.

The volume of raw milk processing is 16 tons per day. Milk is collected from 250 farms within a radius of 70 km, up to 250 000 litres / day.

All farms operate in accordance with good agricultural practice (GAP); the system of milk collection allows tracking the entire chain and identifying a source of inappropriate milk. The procedures of raw milk and other ingredients' procurement for the production of cheese have been developed.

Number of staff: total 113 people, of which 60 production staff. The plant has 4 branches.

The system of food safety (with HACCP as a basis) was introduced 13 years ago. There were initial difficulties with documentation and training. At a later stage, when all required documents, instructions, records, registers were introduced, it became clear that there was a real need for them. All basic programs on pre-conditions have been developed and followed (HACCP requirements). Manufacturing is certified according to international standards.

Almost all production processes are automatic, with use of software, starting from the acceptance of milk and ending with the packaging.

Acceptance of milk and pasteurization were identified as critical control points.

All salting tubs were filled with brine cheese a few months ago; these baths are more than thirty years old. There is temperature and humidity control system; a laboratory assistant measures the temperature of the brine.

Ventilation is of supply and exhaust type; there is a schedule for filter replacement and preventive maintenance.

Sanitary requirements are followed very strictly.

The company has microbiological and physical-chemical laboratories.

At the time of the site visit the dairy was not operating; staff worked only in the packaging workshop. Staff of the departments ensuring work of infrastructure (lighting, water supply and sanitation, refrigeration, equipment operation and others.) works in "non-stop" regime.

All production staff is regularly trained in the system of food safety management.

As at the time of the site visit the dairy did not work, the group dressed in disposable overalls, passed from a dirty to a clean area.

After being acquainted with the dairy production the group was offered to taste cheese. The company's management responded to all questions. It should be noted that the culture of hospitality and reception of visitors were on a very high level.

#### 2. Visit to trout production farm in Zapozhe-Mylof (http://www.pstrag-mylof.pl/)

The company is located in the channel of the river Byrd, which was built in the second half of the 19th century. The company is privately owned; it has 9 founders.

The rectangular ponds have 2.5 million trout fry (2 trout species), the annual production of fish (weighing 350-450 g) 350 tons.

Water security control is carried out on the entrance and exit from the facility on a quarterly basis. There is an automatic cleaning system of ponds. The company has a wastewater treatment plant and filtration fields.

The system of intake and discharge of water allows adjusting its level; if it is exceeded the alarm system is switched on.

Abstraction of water for the ponds - 2.5 m3 / s, in the big canal - 3.5 m3 / s. The rate of exchange of water in ponds - 35 l / s. Water temperature -  $11-18^{\circ}$  C.

On the surface of the water ponds there are oxygenators allowing to achieve saturation  $O^2$  of 76% (for information - saturation  $O^2$  in the human blood - 98%). Oxygen is stored in separate tanks of blue colour.

Above the surface of the ponds there is a mesh cover for protection from birds.

The group had the opportunity to see the process of catching young fish, and sorting them by size. Food for young fish is imported and contains vegetable proteins, amino acids and vitamins.

The company carries out the primary processing of fish and smoking (in small volume). Then the fish is delivered for processing to other companies. On the premises of the enterprise, there is a shop selling products manufactured.

The guide who did a tour for the group was ichthyologist (his specialty). He provided the group with very interesting information about trout, as a biological form, surprisingly, it turned out, trout distinguished colours, voices and sounds and communicated.

At the entrance to the company group was asked to put on shoe covers, apparently to protect the territory of the company from bringing alien flora.

The company had water tanks and piping for watering vegetable plots of the employees located close to the company.

The cooler located on the territory of company had an "ice coat" which was very thick; a certain level of thickness is allowed.

#### 3. Visit to the group of vegetables and fruit (V&F) producers "Jagoda" in Debzhne.

The V&F group includes more than 30 individual households; total area exceeds 180 hectares. The group is a voluntary association of enterprises with the status of legal entity. The board, working on a voluntary basis, carries out the group's management.

Each farm has its own specialization. For example: production of strawberries, currants or apples, pears, plums and others. Depending on the specialization, the farm has its own fleet of agricultural machinery and equipment. Due to the fact that the area of most farms is small (2-5 hectares), agriculture alone cannot not make production financially sustainable, so the farms have united and formed a group of producers (for the first time in Poland), developed a business plan for 5 years, received the first grant from the European Union (EU) for the development of the Group. The grant funds were used for acquiring trailer farm equipment for each member of the group according to their specialization. For example, combine for collecting cherries, currants; warehouse and refrigeration rooms were built, which are the property of the group of producers. Own contribution of the group amounted to 15%.

In accordance with the legislation of the EU, during the first five years the group receives financial support for administrative expenses in the amount of 10% - the first year of operation; 8% - for the second year of operation depending on the results of the first year of operation and 6% - during the next four years of the group operation of the (depends on the volume of products sold by the group). Moreover, the group members must produce these products. Each member of the group assumes the obligation, prescribed in the rules of the group and in agreement signed with each participant, to sell at least 80% of produce through the group. The group has signed contracts for the supply to several canneries, which allows them to obtain the most competitive prices. In addition, the group acquired a production line for direct pressing of juice (manufactured by "Voran"), making its position on the market even more stable.

The group market produced products through wholesale market.

### 4. Visit to meat processing factory SKIBA (http://www.zmskiba.pl/?pid=home&language=ru) Hoynitsi, Derdovskego str, 23

The premises of the enterprise has limited access, there is a permitting system. Slaughterhouses are located remotely, so no traces of animals could be seen. The company is engaged in processing lamb, beef and pork. Animals go to the slaughter from livestock farms, performing the requirements of good livestock practices and controlled by the veterinary service.

The company is certified by BRC, FSSC; it has numerous awards for the quality of products and prizes in sports competitions. The history of the company is reflected in the photos posted in the administrative part of the enterprise.

The group was dressed in overalls and moved in the direction of the production staff. Each zone has a turnstile at the entrance for cleaning, washing and disinfection of shoes and hands.

Each unit, depending on a process it performs, has its own colour of clothing: white colour - processing, light blue - packaging, green - cutting; red - smoking.

The sanitary area has changing rooms, showers, laundry, clean sets of clothes, spare shoes, which can be replaced several times per shift. There is a dining room for meals; the employees do not leave the company; the company provides meals.

Cleaning and disinfection of containers is automatic; cleaning and disinfection of equipment and inventory, premises is performed by own personnel at the end of each cycle. Alkaline and acidic cleaning solutions and chlorine containing disinfection products applied for this

purpose are allowed for use by a food processing company. For general cleaning and washing sub-contracting companies are involved. Metal detection and smoking (hot and cold) were mentioned as critical management points.

The group was guided by Mr. Sikorski, the Head of production and the Head of the HACCP group. It was forbidden to take pictures; personal belongings were left in the administrative area.

The group visited a sausage workshop, saw the process of cooking ground beef, workshop for processing guts, workshop for deboning and trimming carcasses, stocks of finished products, refrigerators and freezers; the temperature of the cooled product, the temperature and air humidity are recorded in electronic registers.

#### The purity and the absence of smells is amazing!

The company has microbiological and physical-chemical laboratories. There is a system of production control laboratory.

### **5. Visit to canning factory BRUSPOL** (http://www.bruspol.pl/), Zhabno, 39, 89-632 Brusy.

Small private family company, located compactly in a small area, is engaged in the purchase and processing of wild mushrooms and berries.

Staff is recruited only for seasonal work (up to 50 people), has 150 points of raw product purchase.

Purchased wild mushrooms are sorted and frozen immediately; after these raw products are processed and canned.

The company has regular suppliers of raw materials and regular customers for finished products. At the time of the visit a batch of white mushrooms was being prepared to be sent to Italy.

The company also produces canned fruit, syrups and sweet pepper.

There is a compact line for inspection and seaming of cans, autoclaves, labelling equipment, equipment for packaging cans, and others.

There is a small room for the storage of finished products; finished products are on wooden pallets close to the walls.

The company has introduced elements of HACCP, there is a physical and chemical laboratory for qualitative analysis of products.

Good hospitality and products sampling should be also mentioned.

#### 6. Visit to canning factory FUNGOPOL (http://www.fungopol.pl/) in Brusy.

Another family-owned company, established in 1992. The head of the enterprise is a food technologist, so most recipes of new products he develops himself. The company produces 64 kinds of products, including canned wild mushrooms and berries. The company was a participant of the AGROFOOD exhibition in Poznan.

The company and the products are certified according to ISO 9000, 22000, FSSC. In addition, the company is certified as a manufacturer of ecological products and a part of the products of the enterprise is ecological. These are interesting products, such as: "Cranberry apple", "Chokeberry desserts", "Berry mousse", "Chokeberry for meat", "Blueberries with pears", "Chokeberry for tea," "Briar jam".

The group visited the production workshop for mushroom washing, sorting, blanching, filling and seaming cans.

Quite a large range of manufactured products is stored in a warehouse.

Very hospitable management of the company; the group participants tasted delicious products.

### 7. Visit to vegetable producing group GREENGROW (http://www.greengrow.pl/ru.php), Vikrovo, Gronovo Elblonske.

Private family farm growing vegetables started its activities over 30 years ago. In 2008 Bednarchukov family: father, sons and a daughter created a group of vegetable producers in the form of a limited liability company.

The group is engaged in cultivation, primary processing and sale of carrots, beets, celery, parsley, cabbage, cauliflower and potatoes. Annually GREENGROW in average sells more than 20 thousand tons of fresh vegetables to markets in Europe.

The company has advanced innovative equipment for washing, sorting, packing carrots. All the equipment is of the European and Polish manufacturers. The lines that thee group saw were not equipped from the beginning to the end by a single firm; they are the result of creative thinking of the head of the family and his sons. The guide (the founder of the group) told the group that he had travelled all over the world in order to learn all the best and implement it at home, and, of course, to avoid possible errors. All processes are automated. The group of vegetable producers GREENGROW, similarly to the group JAGODA, received grant support from the European Union to create a production basis for the group, which in percentage terms amounted to 75% of the cost of the investment project, designed and calculated in the business plan of the group. This business plan is developed for 5 years and must be performed by both the group and by the European Union (provided that the group performs obligations prescribed in the business plan).

The company is certified by BRC, GlobalGAP (Good Agricultural Practice).

The group was able to track the entire process - from harvesting to storing of packaged products and sending them to the commercial network. The group saw the lines for acceptance of vegetables, sorting by size, removal of tops and clods of the earth, the primary wash, wash tanks with drinking water, cooled to  $5^{\circ}$  C + 0-, drying roots, packaging, storage under certain controlled parameters of temperature and humidity.

The company has two agronomists, who control all agronomic parameters.

The company does not produce organic products, but use of insecticides is limited and herbicides are not applied.

The company has regular customers; problems with sales do not happen.

#### 8. Visit to sugar factory in Malborke (http://www.polski-cukier.pl/).

A large enterprise with automated control systems of production processes, with an autonomous system of electricity and heat, producing sugar from sugar beet for many decades.

The company has a certified safety management system and product quality.

After visiting the above enterprises, the study tour participants have made the following conclusions:

- All participants noted the need for the implementation of HACCP at enterprises as a guarantee of food safety for the consumer and the manufacturer (noted by all participants of the trip);
- The participants made sure that the implementation of HACCP allowed expanding the markets for products, in the first turn;
- The participants have concluded that the cooperation between primary producers and processors is feasible for improving the marketing of products at competitive prices, the deepening of industrial specialization and the quality of products as well as attracting investment;

- The participants have been convinced in the need to work with the producers of raw materials to create formal or informal groups of producers (noted by all participants in the group);
- The participants have seen a lot of new marketing solutions, including: the possibility
  of promoting goods by small producers in the local market due to its exclusivity;
  constantly working with raw material suppliers; advertising products at various
  exhibitions and fairs, including through tasting and promotion of its brand via
  websites; the association of various producers for the solution of common problems.

#### III. Visit to Pomorsky Agricultural Advisory Service.

During a visit to this Advisory Service, the Deputy Director, Eva Shimanskaya, introduced the group into the structure of the agricultural consultancy in Poland. It is as follows: state and municipal advisory services, as well as private consulting and advisory firm.

The structure of the governmental agencies includes: agricultural consulting centre in Brvinove and three branches in Krakow (rural development and rural tourism) in Radom (organic production, proper agricultural equipment) and Poznan (economy). This centre is created at the Ministry of Agriculture of Poland and its main task is focused on training of the consultants and the development of the necessary methodologies.

In addition, the state budget funding is allocated to 16 provincial (regional) centres of agricultural consulting (in each province) for the implementation of statutory objectives and governmental tasks. This funding covers approximately 50% of financial needs. The rest of the amount is earned by centres through provision of paid services, including for the development of business plans for farmers and producers' groups. The regional consultation centres have their own structure, which consists of 2-4 regional branches and district offices.

Pomorski Advisory Service is located in Gdansk and provides consultations to experts from regional offices.

State advisory services are not accredited by the Ministry of Agriculture, but for private entities such accreditation is required. However, in order to provide certain consulting services, such as the development of a five-year environmental management plan for the economy, or plan for organic farming, consultants need to be certified. The register of consultants (both private and public) is kept by the Ministry of Agriculture. Any farmer has the opportunity to choose his/her adviser and the money from the budget (coming from the EU and from the Republic of Poland) will be provided for consultancy. Supervision of the activities carried out by the advisory centres is imposed on the Ministry of Agriculture.

Pomorski Advisory Service has 14 weather stations that prepare the weekly weather forecast and the forecast of pests, conduct joint planning for plants treatment. For treatment farmers use only authorized insecticides, i.e. those registered by Ministry of Agriculture. In addition, advisory centre has a laboratory for analysis of feed, soil and agricultural products.

Consulting centres conduct continuous training of specialists, consultants, and of course, farmers. Pomorski consulting centre annually conducts three major agricultural exhibitions: in May - spring garden exhibition; in June - Zulawski agricultural exhibition, in which in average more than 600 producers participate: manufacturers of agricultural machinery and equipment, mineral fertilizers and plant protection products, animal feed. In addition, during the exhibition the exhibition of breeding livestock takes place. Autumn exhibition is an exhibition for gardeners, private traders, lovers of flowers and ornamental shrubs. At this exhibition one may buy a variety of flower seeds, planting material of fruit trees and ornamental shrubs and trees, many hand made goods.

Such exhibitions are platforms for exchanging experiences for both the exhibitors and visitors because more than 50 000 visitors visit each exhibition in average.

After visiting the centre, the study tour participants have made the following conclusions:

- necessity of creation of such structures in both countries;
- when planning other projects, significant part of time should be given to the study of the experience of creation and functioning of advisory services in the European countries, especially in Poland;
- both farmers, and businesses suffer from a lack of qualified consultants who can assist in developing business plans, searching for new technologies, etc.